

## BLM 6.5C Developing a Fair Ethical Judgment

---

### **Position 2: The deportation was fair in the context of the time.**

Your assigned position is that deportation was fair in the context of war and the Acadians' refusal to meet reasonable British requirements. Whether or not you agree with this, argue for it as strongly as you can. Consider the arguments below and prepare a statement of your position. Listen carefully to your opponents' viewpoints and learn their thinking as well. Insist that they support their position with facts and reasons. Determine where you both need more information.

#### **Arguments:**

1. Consider the context: war with France was coming. Acadia was on the front lines. The survival of the British colonies was at stake. Any reasonable military commander of a country today or in the past would want full loyalty of all those in its territory, as Lawrence did.
2. The capture of 200 Acadians inside the French fort of Beauséjour showed that the Acadians were not neutral. This fact supports Governor Lawrence's decision to protect the lives of his people.
3. Britain was tolerant toward the Acadians for years. Although the Acadians were a conquered people, the British let them keep their land, practise their Catholic religion, and generally live as they pleased. Until this threat to Nova Scotia and other British colonies, they were even allowed to refuse to defend the colony. The Acadians should have repaid British kindness.
4. The Acadians were given a clear choice—swear full allegiance or be deported. They chose their fate.
5. Ideas such as human rights, equal rights, or the right to a homeland did not develop until the 1760s and the American and French revolutions. We should not expect that people of this time period would be familiar with the modern belief in the right to a homeland, let alone uphold it.